One cannot deny that thousands of schools across the United States and abroad have multi-ethnic student bodies...and that intergroup relations are frequently restricted and tense.

--Y. Rich 1987, p. 498

If we are to attain real peace in this world, we will have to begin with the children.

--M. Gandhi (quoted in Swadener 1988, p. 5)

Introduction

INTERCULTURAL TENSIONS IN SCHOOLS

In many school settings across the U. S., interracial, interethnic, and other intercultural tensions are major impediments to improving student achievement, social behavior, and attitudes. "These tensions," write Klugman and Greenberg (1991), "manifest themselves among students and between students and staff members."

During a recent 11-month period, the Community Relations Service of the U.S. Department of Justice, which records and responds to reports of intercultural strife in schools, logged "conflict ranging from incidents of name calling and distribution of hate literature on campus to gang fights involving weapons and fatal attacks" (p. 96). Writing about intercultural relations in schools, Parrenas and Parrenas note that:

...the problem of poor race relations among students is progressive: each school year students choose fewer friends outside their own ethnic or cultural group....by the end of elementary school they begin to segregate themselves along race lines. Racial divisions and tensions increase through middle school, culminating by high
school in students isolated from those in other racial groups. Whether or not there is the appearance of racial gangs, there is racial tension (1990, pp. 7-8).

Easing strained intercultural relations and fostering more positive interaction among diverse groups in educational settings have been the focus of considerable work on the part of many legislators, educators and citizens. Large-scale efforts ranging from court-mandated school desegregation to implementation of multicultural education programs and increased attention to cultural learning styles have been undertaken to address intercultural inequities and tensions. While these and other actions have met with some success, intergroup strife continues to be a major concern of educators, students, parents, and the public.

**CHANGING U.S. DEMOGRAPHICS**

Widespread concern about intercultural relations is also growing due to the profound changes taking place in the composition of the U.S. population—changes which are causing the U.S. to become a more culturally diverse nation than ever before.

The following are highlights from the work of a few of the researchers and other education writers who have analyzed and commented on these demographic shifts:

- In 1980, five out of six Americans were white; one out of six was black, Hispanic, or Asian. By 2000, the proportion of whites will have dropped to two out of three, while the minority proportion will have doubled to a third.
- The above distinctions mask significant internal diversity. Hispanics, Asians and immigrant whites come from many different countries and cultures.
- The white population is both older and less prolific than many other groups.
- Of the ten countries sending the most new immigrants to the U.S., five are Caribbean, three are Asian, and one is South American. The only European source of immigrants in the top 10 is the former Soviet Union.
- By the year 2000, Hispanics will comprise the largest single segment of school-aged children in California and throughout the Southwest. By the year 2020, California's whites will account for only 40 percent of the state's population.
- "Minorities" constitute the majority of school enrollments in 23 of the nation's largest cities.
- By the year 2000 more than 50 major U.S. cities will have a "majority minority" population.
- The school population with limited English proficiency (LEP) has increased by more than 250 percent in the past decade. Increases in the number of LEP students are occurring even in school districts with declining enrollments. In New York City, 35 percent of public school students speak a language other than English at home.


At the same time that the school-aged population is becoming more multicultural, the teaching profession is becoming more mono-cultural. In 1985, approximately 88 percent of the U.S. teaching force was white; by the year 2000 this is expected to increase to 95 percent (Burstein 1989; Pine and Hilliard 1990; Sleeter 1990). This imbalance, too, can be a source of intercultural tension, since the values and teaching/learning approaches of the predominantly white staff can often work to the academic and social advantage of white students and to the disadvantage of others (Pine and Hilliard 1990, p. 597).
THE FOCUS OF THE LITERATURE SYNTHESIS

The body of literature about cultural diversity in relation to education is enormous and addresses many different topics. It is important, therefore, to specify the intent and range of this synthesis. Its purpose is to identify schooling practices which well-designed research has shown to be related to changes in intercultural relations in educational settings. The approach taken involves (1) examining research on practices that educators have used to reduce negative intercultural attitudes and behaviors and/or to promote positive ones, (2) determining how well those approaches have worked, and (3) making recommendations based on findings.

Definition

As a prelude to analyzing the effects of activities aimed at improving intercultural relations, it is important to establish what is meant by "culture" and what kinds of groups count as "cultures" in the context of the literature. Ploumis-Devick expresses a view which is gaining widespread currency when she writes:

"Culture is basically a framework for behavior. It consists of human-made guidelines, written and unwritten, that serve to provide order to how groups of people relate to one another and to their world. Cultural diversity refers simply to the differences which exist among cultural groups" (1992, p. 6).

This definition is helpful, because of its broad conception of culture. And, indeed, much of the recent research and other writing on intercultural relations and multicultural education has gone beyond issues of race and ethnicity (which tend to come to mind first when thinking of culture) to include other groups that have been targets of prejudice and discrimination. Researchers Sleeter and Grant write:

"Originally linked only to concerns about racism in schooling, [multi-cultural education] has expanded to address sexism, classism, and handicapism (1987, p. 421)."

In a similar vein, Merrick notes that:

"The multicultural education of the 1970s included programs on women and a variety of ethnic groups. In the 1980s, multicultural/multiethnic education encompasses other Americans whose life-styles differ from that of the status quo (1988, p. 6)."

Arguing for an even broader view of multi-cultural education, University of Washington Multicultural Education Center Director, James Banks, writes:

"A lot of people are on the margins of society because of their race, class, gender, or sexual orientation. Multi-cultural education is about bringing them to the center, making one nation from many people. That is consistent with the nation's motto, "E Pluribus Unum" (quoted in Lockwood 1992, p. 7)."

Also encouraging us to expand our understanding of intercultural strife and the need to address it, Byrnes writes:
...the terms "prejudice" and "discrimination" are most often associated with victims of racism, ethnocentrism, sexism, and religious bigotry. Such a narrow view of these social phenomena, however, may prevent our acknowledging and addressing other less familiar forms of prejudice and discrimination that occur in the social worlds of children and adults. Socioeconomic class bias, bias against the disabled, aesthetic discrimination against those who do not meet cultural expectations of attractiveness, and biases against certain lifestyles all involve prejudices and discriminatory practices that have been observed among elementary school children (1988, p. 267).

The next section of this report, which is devoted to an overview of the research literature on enhancing intergroup relations, identifies the broad array of "cultures" with which this literature is concerned--as both subjects and objects of intercultural strife and intercultural goodwill.

If culture is describable as a behavioral framework, then cultural sensitivity and cultural literacy would require a more-than-superficial familiarity with an array of such frameworks. Reviewing research on classroom management for culturally diverse classrooms, Grossman (1991) writes:

To be culturally sensitive is to be aware of the ways in which cultures differ and the effects of these differences. To be culturally literate is to have a detailed knowledge of the cultural characteristics of specific groups. This knowledge is not merely about holidays, food, dances, music, and so forth. It includes values, behavioral norms, acceptable and effective reinforcements, patterns of interpersonal relationships, and so on (pp. 161, 191).

The Research Literature on Approaches to Promoting Intercultural Harmony

Ninety-one documents were examined in preparation for this report. Fifty-five of these are research documents concerned with the impact of various schooling practices on the intercultural knowledge, attitudes, and/or behavior of teachers and students. Another 36 are related research or research-based documents--demographic studies, position papers, inquiries into the nature of prejudice, program descriptions, and discussions of differing cultural traits and learning styles.

The research literature on cultural diversity is itself very diverse. Of the 55 research reports on approaches to improve intercultural relations, 32 are studies or evaluations, 21 are reviews or syntheses, and 2 summarize both review and study efforts.

Subjects in 43 of the reports are students (1 preschool/Kindergarten, 14 elementary, 7 secondary, 3 postsecondary or other adult, and 18 general elementary-secondary or unspecified student population). Preservice teachers are the subjects of 5 of the reports, and inservice teachers are the subjects in 4.

While 16 of the reports focusing on students do not specify the cultural groups to which their subjects belong (describing them only as "culturally diverse" or "culturally mixed"), the other 27 documents do identify the groups their subjects represent. Some of these designate subjects by general cultural membership, such white or Anglo (14 studies), black or African-American (12), Hispanic or Chicano or Latino (4), Asian (4), and Native American (2). Others identify their subjects by specific background nationality, including Mexican (3 studies), Puerto Rican (2),
and Cuban, Ecuadorian, Nicaraguan, Haitian, Pakistani, Chinese, Vietnamese, Hmong, and Israeli (1 each). Some of this research also studied the differential effects of certain schooling practices on males versus females and disabled versus able-bodied subjects.

Looking at the research on preservice and inservice teachers, four of these studies indicated only that their subjects were culturally diverse, but groups specified in the other 5 studies included white or Anglo (5 studies), black or African-American (3), and Hispanic (2).

Another way of looking at the range of human diversity represented in these documents is to review the outcome areas with which the research is concerned. Though the studies and reviews are structured differently from one another, nearly all are concerned with subjects' knowledge and/or attitudes and/or behavior toward a people of a given race, ethnicity, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, political orientation, socioeconomic class, achievement level, or ability-disability status. A typical research design involves exposing subjects to some kind of in-school treatment and studying the effects of that treatment on the subjects' outlook toward persons whose race, ethnicity, religion, and so on is different from their own.

Some investigations are concerned with impact on more general outcomes, for example, "cross-cultural relations," "intergroup tolerance," or attitudes toward "minority groups," "cultural diversity," "alternative lifestyles," and "human differences." Still others focus on changes produced by these in-school treatments in the incidence of behaviors emanating from intergroup tensions--behaviors such as vandalism, graffiti, distribution of "hate literature," fights, detentions, suspensions and expulsions.

What kinds of "in-school treatments" does one encounter? The research base is concerned with the effects of many kinds of schoolwide and classroom-level managerial and instructional behaviors. Researchers and reviewers have investigated the ways that knowledge, attitudes, and behavior are affected by: school desegregation, other forms of increased intergroup contact, cooperative learning activities, multicultural education, cultural immersion, self-esteem-building activities, prejudice-reduction activities (e.g., role-taking, use of dramatic presentations, counter-stereotyping, etc.), activities to build critical thinking skills, parent involvement, school staff modeling of harmonious intercultural contact, and academic tracking.

In the studies of preservice or inservice teachers, researchers usually focus on the effects of multicultural education classes or trainings on the knowledge, attitudes and teaching behavior of subjects, particularly in relation to cultural minority groups.

**Research Findings I: Students**

**MULTICULTURAL EDUCATION**

Attempting to identify a research link between multicultural education and increased intercultural harmony is a maddening enterprise, largely because the term encompasses such a broad array of activities. In two large-scale literature reviews conducted by Grant, Sleeter, and Anderson (1986) and Sleeter and Grant (1987), the researchers identified dozens of programs and activities called "multicultural education" and clustered these into several major categories, including

1. **Business as Usual with Minimal Compliance to Civil Rights Laws.** Such activities typically involve mixing students in school "on the basis of race, sex, and handicap," but
keeping to very traditional curriculum and instruction. This approach is characterized by a belief that cultural assimilation is desirable.

2. **Teaching the Exceptionally or Culturally Different.** This approach is also posited on the conviction that cultural assimilation is desirable and that it will occur more efficiently if nonmainstream students are offered instructional strategies and materials that accommodate language and cultural differences--until the students can succeed without these "bridges."

3. **Human Relations.** Based on the assumptions that tolerance of differences is desirable and people who differ should treat each other humanely, this approach typically involves adding to the standard curriculum and instruction some additional activities promoting cross-group interactions and opportunities for all to succeed.

4. **Single Group Studies.** Developers of these activities hold to the idea that cultural assimilation is undesirable and that knowledge and appreciation of different groups' histories, cultures, and contributions will foster such appreciation. Courses on specific groups are offered alongside the regular curriculum.

5. **Multicultural Education.** Though all of these approaches have been called "multicultural education," the authors argue that true multicultural education is aimed at reducing social stratification and assimilation by promoting knowledge and appreciation of America's cultural diversity. In keeping with this goal, curricula are rewritten to reflect ethnic, gender, social class, and handicap diversity, etc.; diverse learning styles are honored and accommodated; languages other than English have a place in instruction; and nontraditional staffing patterns are encouraged.

6. **Education that is Multicultural and Social Reconstructionist.** In addition to the above multicultural education provisions, educators prepare students to challenge social stratification directly through such means as having them study current social issues and teaching them political action skills.

Other researchers and writers who have made a specialty of providing and/or studying multicultural education offer similar views. Some examples:

- "Multicultural education rejects the 'melting pot' theory and advocates movement toward a culturally pluralistic society" (Merrick 1988, p. 5).
- "Multicultural education has been a reform movement aimed at changing the content and processes within schools. Originally linked only to concerns about racism in schooling, it has expanded to address sexism, classism, and handicapism" (Sleeter and Grant 1987, p. 421).
- "The goal of multicultural education...is education for freedom.' First, I mean that multicultural education should help students to develop the knowledge, attitudes, and skills to participate in a democratic and free society. Secondly, multi-cultural education promotes the freedom, abilities, and skills to cross ethnic and cultural boundaries to participate in other culture and groups" (Banks, quoted in Lockwood 1992, p. 5).
- "Multicultural education is a process through which individuals develop ways of perceiving, evaluating, and behaving within cultural systems different from their own (Gibson 1984, quoted in Ploumis-Devick 1992, p. 6).
- "Although the advocates of multicultural education do not all speak with one voice, several concerns are central to the idea of multiculturalism: (1) a more balanced version of history; (2) the personal development and interpersonal relations of students--especially with respect to their own ethnic/racial identity, self-esteem, and intergroup relations; (3) fair and effective approaches to individual differences in learning styles that are believed to have links to cultural influences; (4) multi-cultural representation in the entire school environment--staffing, policies, and procedures, and staff organization
Clearly, one of the goals of multicultural education is to promote improved intercultural relations. How effective multicultural programs have been in bringing about improvements is difficult to determine, however, partly because of the lack of specificity in the use of the term "multicultural education," but also because there is not a great deal of systematic research on the effects of entire programs.

One thing we do know is that programs--whether they are called "multicultural education" or something else--are unlikely to improve cross-group relations if their treatment of cultural diversity is too brief or too superficial. Programs designed to expand students' knowledge of other cultures through, for example, the presentation of facts and other information, generally have little or no effect on attitudes or behavior. Neither do "one-shot" or other brief activities, regardless of their content. (Byrnes and Kiger 1986-87; Garcia, Powell, and Sanchez 1990; Gimmestad and De Chiara 1982; Hart and Lumsden 1989; Merrick 1988; Pate 1981, 1988)

Pate writes:

The cognitive, affective, and behavioral components of prejudice are not necessarily related....We might expect that the way people think, their attitudes, and their behavior would be closely related; research indicates that this is not always true (1981, p. 289).

So what kind of multicultural programming is effective in fostering the attitudes and behavior that characterize harmonious interaction? Such research as there is indicates that multicultural education is most beneficial:

- When all children are involved
- When it is in depth, long-term, and infused into the overall curriculum
- When children are introduced to multi-cultural activities as young as possible
- When teachers have the attitudes, training, materials, and support needed to deliver high-quality multicultural education activities.


In addition to these general findings about multicultural education, there is a rich body of research literature on specific managerial and instructional practices which enhance intercultural relations, e.g., cooperative learning, critical thinking development, and activities aimed at building student self-esteem. Since these practices are present in many programs designated as multicultural education, we can submit that programs which include these practices are likely to be successful in bringing about more harmonious intercultural relations. We can also speculate with confidence that programs lacking these elements will meet with less success. A discussion of practices follows.

**CONTACT AMONG DIFFERENT CULTURAL GROUPS**

In some settings, bringing students into task-related and social contact with those who are culturally different from themselves has influenced attitudes for the better and led to positive intergroup relations. In other settings, attitudes and interactions have remained unchanged or
even worsened. What accounts for the difference?

In 1954, Gordon Allport published what has since become a well-known theory of interracial and interethnic contact. Drawing from research findings about intergroup contact and its outcomes, Allport concluded that contact can reduce prejudice and foster positive relationships between members of different cultural groups under certain conditions. These include:

- Equal status in the situation
- Opportunity to get to know one another as individuals
- Common interests and similar characteristics, such as age or occupation
- Social norms favorable to association between the two groups, especially standards set by leaders in the situation
- Circumstances favoring--or at least not antagonistic to--cooperation
- Opportunity to advance individual or group goals through cross-cultural interaction.

Subsequent researchers have validated Allport's findings, as well as identifying additional conditions under which intercultural contact among students is beneficial, including:

- When it is extracurricular and social as well as academic (Foster 1989; Rich 1990; Robinson 1979; Rogers, Miller, and Hennigan 1981)
- When it is frequent and sustained (Foster 1989; Schwarzwald, Fridel, and Hoffman 1985; Peck, Donaldson, and Pezzoli 1990).

As one might expect, researchers have also found that intergroup contact which takes place in the absence of all or most of these conditions generally does not lead to improved relationships and may even lead to a deterioration of cross-cultural attitudes and behavior. We know that neither school desegregation, in and of itself, nor smaller-scale projects involving only cultural mixing, produce true social integration (Parsons 1984; Roberts 1982; Walberg and Genova 1983). Instead, intercultural contact can be described as a necessary but not sufficient condition of genuine integration. In his analysis of teaching strategies that promote positive cross-cultural relations, Roberts writes:

Integration does not just occur naturally as a result of merely placing students of different races or ethnic groups together in the same school setting....Integration, instead, is achieved by conscious effort, particularly of classroom teachers (1982, p. 3).

A circumstance in which deliberate increases in intergroup contact has been shown to cause more harm than good is when culturally mixed groups are assembled and given a task, only to experience failure. If the group task is poorly explained, too difficult for participants, or otherwise inappropriate in such a way that the group cannot successfully complete it, participants are likely to blame students who differ from themselves--in race, gender, ability, etc.--for the failure. When managed well, however, group learning activities can be extremely successful, as detailed in the next section.

**COOPERATIVE LEARNING**

The use of cooperative learning as a means to improving intercultural relationships is supported by more well-designed research than any other single schooling practice. Organizing learners into culturally heterogeneous teams, giving them tasks requiring group cooperation and interdependence, and structuring the activity so that the teams can experience success, comprise

This finding holds true for learners of all ages, including adults, and for virtually every kind of difference--race, ethnicity, handicap, sex, academic ability, and so on. Following participation in cooperative learning activities, learners typically show increases, not only in the number of cross-cultural contacts and friendships they identify, but also in the depth and importance of those friendships. Marked decreases in intergroup tension are noted as well, both by observers and by cooperative learning participants themselves. "The essence of the idea," writes Pate, "is that when we share common problems, tasks, goals, and success with people of another ethnic group, we develop positive feelings toward them" (1988, p. 288).

This research also shows that heterogeneously grouped learners experience other positive outcomes, such as increased self-esteem; improved attitudes toward school, specific classes, subject areas, and teachers; and greater ability to appreciate the strengths that diverse people, including the handicapped, can bring to a learning team.

Why does cooperative learning have such positive effects? One reason, according to Parrenas and Parrenas (1990), is that research demonstrates that people from many cultural minorities are relatively more cooperative in their basic social orientation than are members of the white majority. Elements of well-run cooperative learning activities, identified by researchers as accounting for its positive intergroup outcomes, include:

- Positive interdependence. Students perceive that they need each other in order to complete the group's task; that they will "sink or swim together."
- Individual accountability. Each student's performance is frequently assessed and the results are given to the group and to the individual.
- Group processing. Groups discuss how well they are achieving their goals and maintaining effective working relationships among members. Teachers give feedback on how well the groups are working together and input for improvement.
- Interpersonal and small-group skills. Teachers teach social and process skills needed for effective group functioning, including leadership, decision-making, trust-building, communication, and conflict-management skills.
- Face to face promotive interaction. Students promote each other's learning by helping, sharing, and encouraging one another's efforts to learn. Students explain, discuss, and teach what they know to their groupmates.

Many of the researchers identified above examined the achievement effects of cooperative learning as well as its effects on intercultural relations. While achievement outcomes are not the focus of the present report, it is worth noting in passing that these, too, are very positive following cooperative learning--at least equal and sometimes superior to other learning structures.

**PREJUDICE REDUCTION AND EMPATHY DEVELOPMENT**

*Prejudice* is defined by Allport as "an aversive or hostile attitude toward a person who belongs to a group, simply because he belongs to that group, and is therefore presumed to have the objectionable qualities ascribed to the group" (1954, p. 8). The researchers and reviewers whose
work was consulted in preparation for this report have focused attention on various forms of prejudice--racism, ethnocentrism, sexism, homophobia, anti-Semitism, handicapism, ageism, socioeconomic bias, and others.

Delores Gallo reflects a widely held view of *empathy* when she writes that "the term empathy is used in at least two ways; to mean a predominantly cognitive response, understanding how another feels, or to mean an affective communion with the other" (1989, p. 100). Other writers, such as Haynes and Avery (1979) also identify a behavioral dimension to empathy, characterizing it as including "the ability...to accurately convey [one's] understanding through an accepting response" (p. 527).

Researchers have examined an array of practices aimed at eliminating inaccurate information, negative attitudes and discriminatory behavior (i.e., prejudice) toward cultural groups other than one's own, and replacing these with accurate information, understanding, positive regard, and prosocial behavior (i.e., empathy), with the goal of bringing about improved intergroup relations. Effective practices include:

- **Film, video, and stage presentations that dramatize the unfairness of prejudice and the harm it causes.** (Garcia, Powell, and Sanchez 1990; Gimmestad and DeChiariia 1982; Hart and Lumsden 1989; Pate 1981, 1988)

  Pate writes:

  Films that are realistic, have a plot and portray believable characters are more effective than message films. When students are able to identify with human emotions, dreams, fears, and problems, they are drawn into the drama and have a clearer picture of the effects of prejudice than they had before (1988, p. 287).

  Researchers have also found that dramatizations with an integrated cast are more effective than those featuring a single ethnic group, and that the most powerful character depictions are those who model desired attitudes or, even better, who model a positive change in attitude.

- **Books and other print materials that portray cultural groups in a positive light.** (Garcia, Powell, and Sanchez 1990; Pate 1988; Swadener 1988)

  Favorable presentations of minority groups in fiction and nonfiction print resources have been shown to modify racial and ethnic attitudes, particularly when their use includes sensitive teacher questioning and guidance of class discussion. Materials with multiethnic characters have the most positive effect on attitudes.

- **Initial focus on one's own culture.** (Cotton 1992; Hahn 1983; Ruiz 1982; Swadener 1986)

  Teaching cross-cultural appreciation works best when learning activities progress from (1) a focus on one's own culture, to (2) identification of similarities between one's own culture and a different culture, and finally to (3) attention to differences between one's own and a different culture.

- **Role-taking and simulation games.** (Cotton 1992; Pate 1981, 1988; Swadener 1986, 1988)

  Acting in plays featuring well-known minority representatives or other activities
calling upon students to take the perspectives of those who are culturally different from themselves have been shown to alter intergroup attitudes and even behavior in positive directions. Pate writes that "prejudice is reduced considerably by empathic role-playing or other vicarious experiences..." (1988, p. 288).

- **Counterstereotyping** (Pate 1981, 1988; Swadener 1988)

Counterstereotyping involves focusing on sample individuals of a given ethnic group who counter the popular stereotype (e.g., Jewish athletes, African-American intellectuals, Hispanic white-collar workers, etc.), or focusing on positive characteristics of whole cultures (e.g., the majority of Puerto Rican New Yorkers are gainfully employed, the majority of African-Americans are not poor). Walsh (1988) adds that although "Research suggests that direct teaching of prejudice-reduction techniques may be ineffective... indirect teaching of the skills and dispositions needed to combat prejudice is effective" (p. 281). Chief among these prejudice-combating "skills and dispositions" are critical thinking skills and positive self-regard.

**DEVELOPING CRITICAL THINKING SKILLS**

Besides being characterized by negative feelings and/or discriminatory behavior, prejudice is also characterized by faulty thinking. Common fallacies of reasoning, such as overgeneralization and failure to follow a line of reasoning through to its logical conclusion, are intrinsic features of prejudicial thinking. While a cognitive function such as critical thinking is usually insufficient by itself to eradicate prejudice, research shows that applying critical thinking skills has been effective in reducing prejudice in some subjects by revealing that it is not logically supportable (Byrnes 1988; Pate 1981, 1988; Walsh 1988, etc.).

"How do we teach students antiprejudicial thinking?" asks Walsh. "We infuse a child's school experience with an emphasis on thinking critically about knowledge and life. Thinking critically is the antithesis of prejudicial thinking" (1988, p. 280). Critical habits of mind that have been shown to enhance intergroup relations by reducing prejudice are itemized in Walsh (1988, p. 281):

- Intellectual curiosity--seeking answers to various kinds of questions and problems; investigating the causes and explanations of events; asking why, how, who, when, where
- Objectivity--using objective factors in the process of making decisions; relying on evidence and valid arguments
- Open-mindedness--willingness to consider a wide variety of beliefs as possibly being true
- Flexibility--willingness to change one's beliefs or methods of inquiry; avoiding steadfastness of belief, dogmatic attitude, and rigidity
- Intellectual skepticism--postponing acceptance of a hypothesis as true until adequate evidence is available
- Intellectual honesty--accepting a statement as true when there is sufficient evidence, even though it conflicts with cherished beliefs
- Being systematic--following a line of reasoning consistently to its logical conclusion, avoiding irrelevancies that stray from the issue at hand
- Persistence--supporting points of view without giving up the task of finding evidence and arguments
- Decisiveness--reaching certain conclusions when the evidence warrants
• Respect for other viewpoints—listening carefully to other points of view and responding relevantly to what is said; willingness to admit that one may be wrong and that other ideas one does not accept may be correct.

DEVELOPING HIGH SELF-ESTEEM

The tightest correlation in the research base on intercultural relations is that between positive self-regard and positive regard for those who are culturally different from oneself (Byrnes 1988; Garcia, Powell, and Sanchez 1990; Hart and Lumsden 1989; Mabbutt 1991; Pate 1981, 1988; Peck, Donaldson, and Pezzoli 1990; Walsh 1988). "Probably the most effective approach schools can take to combat prejudice is to improve students' self-concept," writes Pate (1988, p. 288).

Specific self-esteem building activities referenced in the research base include teacher warmth and encouragement; experiencing academic success; working closely with people who have physical or mental handicaps; activities portraying people of one's cultural group or gender, etc. in a positive light; and having teachers and administrators of one's cultural group in one's school.

Other Factors Associated with Intercultural Harmony

Other elements and practices which have been less thoroughly researched, but which have been shown to be related to positive intercultural relations, include:

• Teaching to students' cultural and individual learning styles (Gay 1988; Sanders and Wiseman 1990)
• Participating in in-depth cross-cultural experiences outside the classroom (Mahan 1982; Peck, Donaldson, and Pezzoli 1990; Foster 1989)
• A multicultural balance of school staff and modeling of positive intercultural relations (Merrick 1988; Moore 1988; Pate 1981; Walberg and Genova 1983)
• Parent participation, particularly when parents of different cultures engage in positive interactions (Foster 1989; Ruiz 1982; Sleeter 1990).

INEFFECTIVE AND DETRIMENTAL PRACTICES

Along with their discoveries of effective activities, researchers have also identified instructional behaviors and other schooling practices that are ineffectual or, worse, that backfire, antagonizing learners and increasing intergroup tensions. These include:

• "Message" films and plays. Dramatizations which are thinly veiled vehicles for propagating a particular set of beliefs and values frequently meet with resistance, according to Pate (1981, 1988).
• Human relations training and direct anti-prejudice lessons. These often have effects similar to those produced by message dramas (Gabelko 1988; Oliver and Slavin 1989; Pate 1981, 1988; Walsh 1988; Washington 1981) and for similar reasons: "People do not like to be manipulated" (Pate 1988, p. 288). Pate adds that when people perceive that they are required to participate in activities designed to change their thinking, they frequently rebel, with the net effect that the level of prejudice increases.

These findings have troubled Nina Gabelko of U.C.- Berkeley, who writes:
Most activities aimed at reducing prejudice continue to fly in the face of what we know about both learning and prejudice. For example, the most commonly used strategy for prejudice reduction in the classroom is exhortation....few, if any, students who did not previously agree with such principles are affected positively by such appeals (1988, p. 276).

- **Low expectations as expressed in differential treatment of students on the basis of culture.** (Brophy 1983; Cooper and Tom 1984; Cotton 1990; Grossman 1991, etc.)

  Cultural difference, in the broad sense that culture is used in this report, sometimes influences the kinds of expectations that teachers hold for their students and thus results in differential treatment of students. Cotton's review of the teacher expectations literature itemizes the negative treatment that students sometimes receive because of their gender, race/ethnicity, socioeconomic class, and other factors. These include an array of instructional, management, and interpersonal behaviors that favor males, Anglo whites, and high-SES students, and are related to low achievement and low self-esteem on the part of others, producing negative intergroup relations.

- **Academic tracking.** (Klugman and Greenberg 1991; Moore 1988; Oakes 1985; Rich 1987; Walberg and Genova 1983)

  The negative effects of academic tracking on the achievement, attitudes, and behavior of cultural minority students, and consequently on intergroup relations, is clearly demonstrated by research. Rich writes:

  ...the usual state of affairs is the placement of a disproportionately high percentage of majority children in prestigious groups and a disproportionately high percentage of minority pupils in low status groups. Thus, the net effect of tracking is internal segregation, making the status differential between majority and minority children even more salient and reducing the possibility of positive interethnic contact (p. 496).

**Research Findings II: Teachers**

The intercultural knowledge, attitudes, and behaviors of teachers have powerful effects on the quality of intercultural relations in schools and classrooms. This being the case, it is important to consider the research on practices designed to prepare teachers to successfully teach culturally diverse student populations and promote harmonious relations among them. Larke (1990a) writes:

  Studies have shown that a high correlation exists among educators' sensitivity (attitudes, beliefs and behaviors toward students of other cultures), knowledge and application of cultural awareness information, and minority students' successful academic performance... Effective teachers in diverse settings have been found to exhibit high levels of cultural sensitivity [which is] exhibited by the modified curriculum and instructional designs they incorporate to ensure that all students achieve excellence and equity (p. 24).

Research has also produced findings about kinds of teacher education that do not lead to
successful teaching and positive intergroup relations. The findings of research conducted with preservice and inservice teachers are substantially the same, and thus they are not separated in the following discussion.

What can we learn from the research on efforts to promote accurate knowledge, positive attitudes, and effective instructional and social behaviors on the part of teachers? For one thing, research shows that brief and superficial training may increase knowledge, but has little or no effect on attitudes or behavior. (Bennett, Niggle, and Stage 1989; Grottkau and Nicolai-Mays 1981; Larke 1990a; Merrick 1988; Sleeter 1990; Washington 1981)

As with the research involving children and youth, the research on preservice and inservice educators indicates that "one-shot" overviews or short-term courses do not produce the outlook and skills needed to work successfully with diverse populations. Larke writes:

> It seems very important that teacher educators recognize and respond to this concern by providing more than one isolated course...one course is insufficient to change the attitudes and behaviors of preservice teachers to appreciate, accept, and respect the diversity of students facing them in future classrooms (1990a, p. 29).

Research conducted on inservice activities has produced similar findings. Grottkau and Nicolai-Mays conclude that:

> ...abbreviated, unsystematic inservice programs offered to veteran teachers which provide limited exposure to the wide array of problems these educators must face in the pluralistic classroom setting may contribute minimally, if at all, to changes in attitudes toward minority groups....short-term interventions may even be detrimental to the preservation of a respect for human diversity (1981, p. 33).

Conversely, in-depth, sustained multicultural training does lead to the development of attitudes and skills needed to work successfully with culturally diverse groups (Burstein 1989; Grottkau and Nicolai-Mays 1989; Larke 1990a,b; Merrick 1988; Sleeter 1990; Wayson 1988).

Reporting on a study of intensive, long-term multicultural education for teachers in training, Grottkau and Nicolai-Mays write:

> ...exposure over time to multicultural education experiences does contribute to a statistically significant difference in overall levels of bias, as well as levels of bias toward specific minority populations....any intervention geared toward the enhancement of intergroup relationships must not be contrived or arbitrary but rather controlled and sustained if positive attitudes toward minorities are to be achieved (1989, p. 32).

Well and good, but research also indicates that "teachers frequently do not translate their positive attitudes toward multicultural education and enjoyment of multicultural education classes into the actual delivery of multicultural activities in their classrooms" (Merrick 1988, p. 6). In order for accurate knowledge about diverse cultures and positive attitudes toward them to lead to the provision of true multi-cultural education in the classroom, considerable skill development is needed, and this calls for even more intensive education and training.

What kinds of teacher skills and behaviors should be emphasized in programs of teacher training to enable them to foster harmonious relationships among their culturally diverse students? A good beginning answer can be drawn from research that has looked into schools
and classrooms characterized by positive cross-cultural interactions. Genova and Walberg’s large-scale correlational study of successful social integration in schools identifies the following:

- **Racial/ethnic mixing.** While insufficient to guarantee positive outcomes, cultural mixing was found to be an important precondition for their development.
- **Positive staff role models.** Visible and healthy interracial/ethnic relationships prevailed.
- **Security.** Students expressed feeling safe from the threat of intercultural conflict.
- **Staff support for integration.** Beyond role modeling, this refers to openly expressed opinions in favor of integration.
- **Multicultural exposure.** At a minimum, these included activities that present students with a factual accounting of the contributions of various cultures, similarities and differences among cultural groups, etc.
- **Intercultural fairness.** Students perceived that different racial/ethnic groups were treated equally and fairly by school personnel.

In addition to these school-level elements, research has also identified numerous teacher behaviors and other classroom variables as being associated with positive intercultural relationships. They are drawn from the work of Aviram (1987); Campbell and Farrell (1985); Garcia, Powell, and Sanchez (1990); King (1983); Mock (1988); Roberts (1982); Sanders and Wiseman (1990); Simpson (1981); and Swadener (1988). Not surprisingly, many of these features are commonly found in connection with positive classroom environments in general, whether they are culturally diverse or not:

**Self-examination and improvement.** Effective teachers of culturally diverse classes:

- Reflect on their own values, stereotypes, and prejudices and how these might be affecting their interaction with children and parents
- Engage in staff development activities which can expose and reduce biases and increase skill in working with diverse populations.

**Climate and tone.** Teachers in inter-culturally harmonious environments:

- Arrange their classrooms for movement and active learning
- Interact one-to-one with each child at least once daily
- Communicate high expectations for the performance of all students
- Give praise and encouragement
- Communicate affection for and closeness with students through verbal and nonverbal means such as humor, soliciting student opinion, self-disclosure, eye contact, close proximity, smiling, and so on
- Avoid public charting of achievement data
- Give children responsibility for taking care of materials, decorating, greeting visitors, etc.
- Treat all students equally and fairly
- Have classrooms reflect the ethnic heritage and background of all the children in the classroom:
  - -- Artifacts (weavings, photos, etc.) from various cultures are on display
  - -- Teachers use displayed items in learning activities
  - -- Specific items may change, but cultural artifacts are on display throughout the
Instructional and management strategies. Effective teachers:

- Form flexible reading groups
- Make use of cooperative learning groups which are culturally heterogeneous and teach students skills for working in these groups
- Offer learning activities congruent with the cultural and individual learning styles and strengths of students
- Teach students social skills related to getting along well together
- Conduct many learning activities that are not graded
- Include some student-selected activities.

Multicultural activities. Successful teachers:

- Provide accurate information about cultural groups via straightforward discussions of race, ethnicity, and other cultural differences
- Teach both about cross-cultural similarities and differences
- Learn a few words of the language and general background information about the religious backgrounds, customs, traditions, holidays, festivals, practices, etc. of students and incorporate this information into learning experiences for them
- Use a variety of materials rather than relying only on the information in textbooks
- Review materials for cultural biases and stereotypes and remove biased items from the curriculum.

Response to intercultural tension. Successful teachers:

- Take issue with culturally demeaning statements, jokes, graffiti, and so on
- Use racial or other intercultural incidents as a springboard for providing information and skills to avoid such incidents.

Contact with parents. Effective teachers:

- Engage parent involvement
- Demonstrate interest in and respect for the family's culture when interacting with parents
- Find out as much as they can about each child's experiences and family situation that can help them to understand and meet the child's needs.

Recommendations

Having identified this array of effective practices and behaviors, what kinds of teacher training do researchers and reviewers recommend? The following recommendations are taken from the work of the American Jewish Committee (1989); Larke (1990a,b); Merrick (1988); Sleeter (1990); and Wayson (1988). Those recommendations focused specifically on either preservice or inservice teachers are so designated; others apply to both.

- Provide more opportunities to raise the cultural sensitivity of preservice teachers through long-term, in-depth multicultural education.
- Develop a field base to multicultural education courses and methods courses to provide an opportunity for working with culturally diverse students--field trips, classroom observations, telecommunications systems between the university and school classrooms,
etc.
- Develop mentor programs between pre-service teachers and culturally diverse students to raise sensitivity levels about the needs/concerns of diverse students.
- Raise the sensitivity levels of university professors through required or voluntary seminars.
- Seek early field and student teaching sites that are cognizant of diversity and working to promote intercultural harmony.
- Provide instruction to enable teachers to understand students' culturally based and individual learning styles and to match appropriate teaching styles to them.
- Provide instruction in setting up and successfully managing cooperative learning groups; having the teachers themselves experience cooperative learning can enhance their ability to work with students arranged in cooperative groups.
- Provide instruction in methods teachers can use to develop interpersonal awareness and empathy among diverse learners in their classrooms.
- Require training in multicultural education for both administrators and teachers.
- Establish resource centers for multi-cultural materials; publicize and promote the use of these materials.

Writers on the subject of intercultural relations in schools remind us that working to achieve intercultural harmony makes good sense in the present and also represents an important investment in our economic, social, and political future.

Efforts undertaken to foster intercultural goodwill can also help to refashion our schools into more moral environments. "To become moral communities that are supportive and caring," write Pine and Hilliard in their 1990 anti-racism article, "schools need to model empathy, altruism, trust, cooperation, fairness, justice, compassion, democracy and celebration of diversity" (p. 599).

**Key References**

Aviram, O.

Tests a model of the ways that school-controllable factors influence student intergroup attitudes. Offers recommendations based on those aspects of the model that were confirmed by the research. Major findings: Schools affect intergroup attitudes; positive intergroup relations are likely if the principal and teachers are strongly committed to them; activities to reduce the prejudices of parents can be beneficial.

Bennett, C.; Niggle, T.; and Stage, F.

Reviews earlier studies on the impact of a multicultural education course for preservice teachers and reports results of a study suggesting that course design and instructional methods should be modified depending on students' "cognitive
orientation"--dualistic, relativistic, or committed--at the beginning of the course. Recommendations are made based on findings.

Brophy, J.

Reviews the literature on self-fulfilling prophecy effects and concludes that a minority of teachers have major expectation effects on their students' achievement.

Burstein, N. D.

Describes the content and outcomes of an intensive, two-year program designed to equip teachers to work with culturally diverse students. The program focused on increasing knowledge and impacting beliefs about members of minority cultural groups, increasing knowledge and use of validated teaching strategies with them, and building skills in working with language minority students. Posttests and log entries indicate that the program was successful.

Byrnes, D. A.

Discusses the ways that racial, ethnic, religious, and other forms of prejudice are learned and perpetuated, together with an overview of research-based approaches which can reduce prejudice. Highlighted are activities which promote social contact between children from different groups, activities to increase student self-esteem, and critical thinking activities that expose the faulty thinking underlying prejudice.

Byrnes, D., and Kiger, G.

Surveys responses of suburban and rural, isolated elementary school children to identify correlates of religious tolerance. Among the findings: rural children were less aware of religious diversity than were suburban children and were also more likely to hold inaccurate and negative views of religions other than their own.

Campbell, R. L., and Farrell, R. V.

Reports the results of a study in which teachers who work with culturally diverse populations and several professors of teacher education were surveyed regarding the competencies most essential for successful teaching in multicultural settings.

Cooper, H. M., and Tom, D. Y. H.

Reviews research on the effects of teacher expectations on student achievement and
attitudes. Outlines research findings on the behaviors through which expectations are communicated. Offers a model of the ways expectations influence outcomes, and provides recommendations for minimizing the negative effects of expressing low expectations.

Cotton, K.  

Reviews research on childrearing behaviors, training activities, and schooling practices that can foster the development of empathetic feeling and behavior among children and older youth. Identifies as effective such practices as role taking, cooperative learning, modeling of caring behavior, and viewing dramatic presentations of the negative consequences of behaving nonempathetically.

Cotton, K.  

Reviews research on the relationships between a large array of schooling practices and the achievement, attitudes, and social behavior of ethnic minority youth, particularly African Americans and Hispanics, in urban settings. Includes annotated bibliography of approximately 100 sources.

Cotton, K.  

Reviews research on the effects produced when teachers hold and communicate high or low expectations for their students' academic and behavioral performance. Finds that expectations are sometimes formed on the basis of inappropriate factors, such as race/ethnicity, sex, or socioeconomic class, and offers recommendations for creating a positive learning environment for all students.

Davis, B. R.  

Investigates the effect of working in cooperative learning arrangements over an eight-week period on the incidence of interethnic friendships, self-esteem, and perceptions of classroom environment at the elementary, junior high, and high school levels. No significant differences were found between treatment and comparison students on any of the variables studied. Inadequate implementation was blamed for the lack of effects.

DeVries, D. L.; Edwards, K. J.; and Slavin, R. E.  

Studies the effects of the cooperative learning approach, Teams--Games--Tournament, on the incidence of cross-racial friendship and cross-racial choices of
classmates to help with schoolwork. Cooperative learning participants exhibited greater numbers and larger percentages cross-racial friendships and help-seeking behaviors than comparison students.

Foster, L. A.  

Describes the activities and outcomes of "Across the Lines," a project designed to increase mutual knowledge and improve mutual attitudes of students at an all-African-American school and an all-white school. The project has been found to dramatically improve intercultural understanding and appreciation.

Garcia, J.; Powell, R.; and Sanchez, T.  

Reviews research regarding the effects of using multicultural curriculum materials on students' levels of racial and ethnic bias. Presents the results of a study confirming previous findings about the potential of multicultural materials for increasing knowledge and changing attitudes. The way teachers use these materials accounts for much of the data on effectiveness.

Gimmestad, B. J., and De Chiara, E.  

Compares the scores of experimental and control students on knowledge and attitude measures regarding several racial/ethnic groups. Experimental children, who had read dramatic plays about the racial/ethnic groups and participated in related curricular activities, exhibited significantly higher levels of knowledge and acceptance toward those groups than did control children.

Grant, C. A.; Sleeter, C. E.; and Anderson, J. E.  

Submits the array of books on multi-cultural education to an analysis similar to that conducted earlier with journal articles about multicultural education (see Sleeter and Grant 1985, below). Finds the same kinds of differences in the use of the term "multicultural education" as were identified in the journal article review. Offers recommendations for future writings on multicultural education.

Grossman, H.  

Identifies research findings about the differences in learning style and other traits that are observable among students of different cultural backgrounds and argues that awareness of these differences is essential to fair and effective classroom management in culturally diverse classrooms. Also cites research on harmful classroom management approaches often taken by teachers who are either knowingly or inadvertently biased against students from cultural minorities and/or
low SES families.

Grottkaу, B. J., and Nickolai-Mays, S.

Compares the levels of racial/ethnic bias held by senior preservice education teachers who had experienced extensive multicultural training with the level of bias noted in senior students in other majors who had not had such training. Also compares freshman preservice educators who had taken a brief human relations course with freshman who had not, again in terms of racial/ethnic bias. Extensive training resulted in significantly less social bias; a brief course had no effect.

Grundy, T.

Examines general policies and principles of English-as-a-Second-Language (ESL) education and describes ESL policy and programs in the State of Oregon. Includes research-supported assertions regarding intercultural relations of ESL students with other students in settings characterized by diversity.

Hahn, S. L.

Describes the activities and outcomes of an instructional program designed to familiarize primary-level children with the Mexican culture as experienced by Mexican children their own age. Results indicated considerable expansion of knowledge and positive attitudes on the part of the mostly non-Hispanic program children.


Draws from research on the nature and prevalence of racism and on practices which have been shown to reduce prejudice. Describes programs for prejudice reduction and guidelines for program planning. Lists resources agencies and contact information.

Johnson, D. W.; Johnson, R. T.; and Scott, L.

Compares an individualized and a cooperative learning approach in terms of their effects on the achievement and attitudes of white students in grades five and six. Cooperative learning students were grouped heterogeneously by gender and academic ability. Both student attitudes and achievement were more positive in the cooperative arrangement.

King, E. W.
Enumerates the findings from a research project conducted with 32 classrooms of children four to eight years old and their teachers in the Denver Public Schools. Correlations were identified between an array of teacher behaviors and the achievement and progress of children in ethnically diverse classrooms.

Klugman, J., and Greenberg, B.

Describes the activities of and responses to a program developed by the Community Relations Service of the Justice Department to help improve intercultural communication and relations in secondary schools. CRS staff facilitate workshop activities designed to identify and make plans for addressing problems relating to intercultural tensions. CRS follow-up activities depend on the nature of problems at each program site.

Larke, P. J.

Reports findings regarding the cultural sensitivity of preservice teachers following participation in a required multicultural education course. Concludes that one multicultural education course is insufficient to prepare teachers to work successfully with culturally diverse students and their parents. Offers recommendations to improve teachers' preparation in this area.

Larke, P. J.

Identifies the effects of a long-term, intensive program aimed at reducing racial and ethnic bias on the part of preservice teachers. Composed of multicultural education, human relations training, and cross-cultural mentoring, the program was successful in increasing the knowledge and improving the attitudes of participants toward their Mexican-American and African-American mentees.

Mabbutt, R.

Cites findings from research on the nature of racial prejudice in the U.S. and derives implications for educational institutions and other organizations in Idaho. Among key findings: Racial prejudice is learned very early in children's lives and can be changed only with difficulty; social class prejudice interacts with racial prejudice; and people with high self-esteem exhibit relatively low levels of prejudice.

Mahan, J. M.
Uses a variety of measures to evaluate the effectiveness of an intensive cultural immersion project designed to increase the knowledge of preservice teachers about Navajo and Hopi cultures, and to improve their attitudes toward and skills in working with Native American student populations in Bureau of Indian Affairs schools. Participants met with unqualified success in all areas evaluated.

Merrick, R. M.
*Multicultural Education: A Step Toward Pluralism.* South Bend, IN: Indiana University at South Bend, April 1988. (ED 302 451)

Summarizes 31 articles on different aspects of multicultural education--state and national requirements for teachers, teachers' attitudes and practices, impact of college courses on student's knowledge and attitudes, practices used with children and their effects, and the presentation of racial/ethnic groups in texts and other classroom materials.

Moore, H. A.

Compares the leadership behaviors in cooperative groups displayed by Anglo and Hispanic students in "high-equity" schools with those displayed by students in "low-equity" schools. Among the findings was that all students in high-equity schools exhibited more verbal and nonverbal leadership behaviors than students in the low-equity schools. Hispanic students exhibited far fewer leadership behaviors than Anglos in low-equity school settings.

Oakes, J.

Presents findings on the effects of ability grouping--and particularly secondary-level academic tracking--on student achievement, attitudes, and behavior. Concludes that tracking is detrimental to students and discusses the dilemmas posed by its persistent use in schools.

Parrenas, F. Y., and Parrenas, C. S.

Reviews research on the use of cooperative learning in multiracial, multiethnic settings and concludes that cooperative learning, particularly when it involves group tasks and individual accountability, is the most appropriate instructional strategy for culturally diverse school populations.

Parsons, M. A.

Investigates the effects of a desegregation effort in five Delaware school districts on the racial attitudes and attitudes toward education held by black and white parents.
and students. Surveys were conducted from the year before desegregation to three years following. Neither racial nor educational attitudes of participating groups were significantly affected.

Pate, G. S.

Reviews research on various approaches to reduce prejudice, chiefly in educational settings. Among the key findings is that working in interracial, interethnic learning teams fosters positive attitudes and friendships across racial and ethnic lines.

Pate, G. S.

Cites findings from research on different approaches that have been undertaken to reducing racial, ethnic, and religious prejudice. Engaging dramatic presentations, cooperative learning, critical thinking, and self-esteem-building activities are identified as particularly effective in reducing levels of prejudice within and outside of school settings.

Peck, C. A.; Donaldson, J.; and Pezzoli, M.

Identifies, via a study undertaken with nonhandicapped adolescents, benefits that accrue to nonhandicapped students in programs that bring them into frequent contact with young people who have severe handicaps. Subjects reported many personal benefits that emerged from their contacts with the severely handicapped.

Rich, Y.

Cites research on schooling practices which can foster improved minority achievement and self-esteem, as well as improved intercultural relations. Identifies actions that school counselors can undertake to help foster the use of these validated practices in desegregated school settings.

Roberts, G. J.

Draws from a broad base of research to identify instructional and classroom management practices associated with high levels of interracial and interethnic harmony. Findings emerge from two sources: classroom observational research and surveys of teachers whose classrooms exhibited positive cross-cultural relations.

Robinson, M. G.
Describes a program designed to increase understanding of and empathy with disabled children on the part of non-handicapped children. Experiential activities which approximate disabling conditions, exposure to appliances used by the handicapped, and opportunities to meet and interact with disabled adults are featured.

Rogers, M.; Miller, N.; and Hennigan, K.

Investigates the effects produced when black and white female students in a desegregated elementary school are arranged in cross-racial groups for playground games. Both immediate and delayed observations showed increases in cross-racial prosocial interactions following the cooperative game playing experience.

Ruiz, A. J.

Reports the outcomes of an intervention in which 27 second graders, representing nine different national origins, experienced a 12-week program designed to reduce negative racial and ethnic bias. Changes from pretest to posttest indicated a significant reduction in students' level of bias.

Sanders, J. A., and Wiseman, R. L.

Offers findings from a study of the effects of verbal and nonverbal "teacher immediacy" (defined as communication which enhances closeness with another) on the attitudes and learning of white, black, Hispanic and Asian students. Many behaviors were pancultural in their effects, but there were some different noted across the different cultural groups.

Schwarzwald, J.; Fridel, S; and Hoffman, M.

Investigates the effects of cross-cultural contact between Israeli junior high school students of Eastern (Middle Eastern and North African) descent and those of Western (European and American) descent. Contact reduced ethnic stereotyping and fostered positive feelings among students who were acquainted with one another, but students continued to hold stereotypic views of students with whom they were not acquainted.

Simpson, C.

Compares the differential between minority and nonminority performance levels in
third grade classes organized unidimensionally with the differential in classes organized multidimensionally. Multidimensional organization—characterized by many activities that are not graded, a large range of instructional materials, incorporation of some non-language media into learning activities, and some student-selected activities—resulted in a significantly smaller gap between minority and nonminority performance levels than that noted in unidimensional classes.

Slavin, R. E.

Reviews research on the effects of cooperative learning on cross-racial friendships and discusses findings in relation to Gordon Allport's "contact theory," a set of principles specifying conditions under which interracial contact leads to improved relationships. Cooperative learning has been found to increase the number and depth of interracial friendships.

Slavin, R. E.

Reviews research on the social and particularly the achievement effects of cooperative learning groups organized heterogeneously by race, sex, academic ability level, and other factors. Finds that cooperative learning produces outcomes equal or superior to those of other learning structures.

Slavin, R. E.

Identifies areas of agreement and disagreement among researchers and reviewers who have investigated the academic and social outcomes of cooperative learning. Main finding: for K-12, cooperative learning structures characterized by group goals and individual accountability are more beneficial to students' achievement than other structures.

Slavin, R. E., and Oickle, E.

Compares the learning and cross-racial friendship effects of cooperative learning and non-team learning on students in grades six through eight, and compares the differential effects of the cooperative learning approach on the achievement and cross-racial friendships of black and white students. Cooperative team students outperformed non-team students and evidenced more cross-racial friendships. These effects were most pronounced with the black subjects.

Sleeter, C. E.

Reports the results of a survey of teachers in the state of Wisconsin who had
reached instruction in multicultural education as undergraduates. Concludes, as do many other research studies, that participating in only a basic multicultural education course is insufficient to prepare teachers to work successfully with culturally diverse student populations.

Sleeter, C. E


Discusses the need for the kinds of staff development that can improve teachers' approaches to working with culturally diverse classrooms, thereby improving minority student achievement and enhancing cross-cultural relations. Cites research findings and includes descriptions of "promising practices" for staff development in desegregated schools.

Sleeter, E. E., and Grant, C. A.


Reviews the "multicultural education" literature and finds that much of it concerns only limited aspects of what the authors regard as true multicultural education. Organizes the literature according to the ways different authors use the term "multicultural education" and points out the shortcomings of most of these conceptions.

Swadener, E. B.


Presents results of an observational study in two urban day care centers in the midwestern U.S. Activities to promote gender and ability-disability equity were extensive and had positive effects. Those aimed at fostering racial and cultural equity were present but less extensive.

Swadener, E. B.


Presents and discusses findings from a one-year case study of the kinds of activities carried out to enable children to "learn social concepts related to acceptance and understanding of human diversity" and related beliefs and skills. The subjects were children in grades K-4 in a Friends (Quaker) school in rural Pennsylvania. Learning about the work of peace activists, active listening and perspective-taking exercises, and developing group process skills were identified as key elements.

Walberg, H. J., and Genova, W. J.

"School Practices and Climates That Promote Integration." *Contemporary Educational

Analyzes secondary students' perceptions regarding several schooling practices and school climate variables in order to identify factors conducive--and antithetical--to harmonious racial/ethnic integration. Cross-racial contact, positive school staff role modeling, a sense of security, positive interracial attitudes on the part of school staff, multicultural learning activities, and a sense of racial fairness were among the factors positively correlated with successful integration.

Warring, D.; Johnson, D. W.; Maruyama, G.; and Johnson, R.  

Studies, in two experimental designs, the effect of cooperative learning on cross-sex and cross-ethnic student relationships. Participants in all cooperative learning approaches voluntarily involved themselves in more cross-sex and cross-ethnic contacts in the classroom, school, and home than students working individualistically. The cooperative structure involving inter-group cooperation produced the most positive results.

Washington, V.  

Investigates the effects of a week-long inservice program designed to impact the attitudes and instructional behaviors of elementary teachers in one North Carolina district. The antiracism portion of the training was found to increase overt racial polarization, and the multicultural education portion had no effect on teaching behaviors. Recommendations for training redesign are presented.

General References

Allport, G.  

Cites the characteristics of social prejudice, discusses the ways that prejudicial thinking develops in people and is maintained over time, and identifies conditions under which bringing people of different racial/ethnic groups into contact with one another can decrease prejudice.

American Jewish Committee.  

Provides information on rapidly occurring demographic changes due to immigration--particularly immigration of Hispanics and Asians--and provides recommendations for the education of children and adults in an increasingly diverse and technological society.
Arkansas State Department of Education.


Describes the McRAT program of staff development and student activities and provides results of a study of the program on student outcomes following its first year of implementation with fourth, fifth, and sixth graders. The learning gains of McRAT students were significantly higher than those of control students, regardless of racial/ethnic or socioeconomic status.

Banks, J. A.


Discusses the increase in cultural diversity in the United States, problems that have arisen in connection with this increase, psychological effects of social prejudice against minority cultures, schooling practices that impinge on students' self-worth and self-concepts as learners, and recommendations for improving intercultural relations.


Provides information for preservice and inservice teachers to help equip them to work with America's increasingly diverse school population. Focuses on race, ethnicity, social class, religion, gender, language minorities, and exceptionality. Gives special attention to appropriate assessment and parent involvement.

Briscoe, D. B.


Reports on research designed to (1) identify cultural characteristics inhering in different ethnic groups which have implications for learning and (2) identify curricular and instructional approaches which are responsive to the cultural characteristics of different groups. Offers recommendation based on research findings.

Conard, B. D.


Identifies benefits which can accrue from the use of small-group cooperative learning activities in classrooms, with special emphasis on the power of this learning structure for reducing the incidence of prejudice. Gives an example of a cooperative learning exercise focused on world hunger.

Fritzsche, K. P.

*Prejudice and Underlying Assumptions.* Strasbourg, France: Paper presented at the Educational Research Workshop on History and Social Studies, Braunschweig, West
Introduces a framework for textbook researchers to use to identify racial and ethnic bias or prejudice in texts used in schools in Europe. The framework is intended to enable reviewers to discern whether textbooks--either consciously or unconsciously--inaccurately represent ethnic groups and promote prejudices, stereotypes, or racist ideas.

Gabelko, N. H.

Discusses the ways that secondary teachers can help their students to develop the ôcognitive sophisticationö that mediates against prejudicial thinking. Activities that subject prejudicial phenomena to examination using higher-order cognitive skills are described.

Gallo, E.

Argues that, although empathy is sometimes thought to be an emotional response that is unrelated or possibly detrimental to reasoning, empathy in fact fosters both creative and critical thinking, and thus its development should be adopted as an important educational goal.

Gay, G.

Discusses the growing need for multi-cultural programs in the schools, identifies barriers to the design and implementation of truly multicultural programs, and provides guidelines for evaluating curriculum quality.

Gibbs, J.

Details and development and functioning of the Tribes program, in which children are organized into long-term, heterogeneous peer groups or ôTribesö for learning and interpersonal support. Outlines an array of activities suitable for use by student Tribes and their teachers.

Gottfredson, G. D.; Nettles, S. M.; and McHugh, B.

Presents information on the implementation of a middle school demonstration program begun in the Pittsburgh schools in 1989. Many program elements have been implemented, but there is still considerable resistance on the parts of teachers and parents to some program aspects, i.e., the steps taken to eliminate academic
tracking.

Haynes, L. A., and Avery, A. W.

Compares scores on measures of self-disclosure and empathetic understanding of high school juniors who participated in a training program in these areas with the scores of those who did not. Experimental students significantly outperformed controls.

Henington, M.

Reports the effects of a multicultural and nonsexist education program on the cultural and gender-related knowledge and attitudes of preservice secondary teachers. Program participants exhibited greater knowledge and better attitudes than controls on both immediate and delayed assessments. Unfortunately, detail about program content is not provided.

Lewis, A. C., and Hayes, S.

Discusses the importance of training preservice school counselors to work with culturally diverse student populations, and describes the content of training provided at Western Washington University to enable counseling students to work effectively with children of different cultural backgrounds. Also describes a case study of counselor-client interaction.

Lewis, F. N., and Margold, J.

Provides background information about the interaction among culture, learning styles, and learning success and outlines methods that teachers and parents can use to increase children's understanding of and respect for their own and different cultures. Addresses ways to combine multi-cultural and academic curricula.

Lockwood, A. T.

Quotes and discusses the views on cultural pluralism and multicultural education held by Dr. James A. Banks, Director of the Center for Multicultural Education at the University of Washington in Seattle. Key concept: ô...multicultural education is for all children.ö

Lockwood, A. T.
ôManaging Multiculturalism.ö Focus in Change 7 (Summer 1992): 8-11.

Discusses the development of multi-cultural education programming in the New
York City public schools since its inception in 1987. Includes material excerpted from the school board's ôStatement of Policy on Multicultural Education and Promotion of Positive Intergroup Relations.ô

Lomotey, K.

Summarizes research on the disproportionately low achievement of African Americans and other minorities and on the kinds of schooling practices shown to improve academic and social outcomes for culturally diverse student populations.

Mock, K. R.

Discusses the cultural biases typically present in curriculum, instructional methods, instructional materials, and assessment techniques. Offers recommendations for fostering a multicultural classroom environment, and provides a profile of a ôsuccessful educator in a multicultural/multiracial society.î

Oliver, E. A., and Slavin, D.

Offers a description of the National Coalition Building Institute (NCBI) Prejudice Reduction Model designed to improve intercultural and other intergroup relations. The program has been used on over 80 campuses in the U.S. and abroad to reduce racism, sexism, anti-Semitism, homophobia, and other forms of prejudice.

Olsen, L., and Mullen, N. A.

Shares the results of in-depth interviews with 36 California teachers who work with ethnically diverse student populations. Identifies professional activities pursued by these teachers in the areas of second language acquisition, multicultural curriculum development, second language immersion, and prejudice reduction/intergroup relations to improve their effectiveness in working with culturally diverse groups.

Payne, C.

Discusses the ways in which racist policies and practices have been--and still are--embedded in the U.S. educational system. Argues that true multicultural education can help to guide people from a racist stage of personality development to a less racist or nonracist stage. Provides a sample antiprejudice multicultural education unit.

Pine, G. J., and Hilliard, A. G.
ôRx for Racism: Imperatives for America's Schools.î Phi Delta Kappan 71/8 (1990):
Discusses the nature of racism in American society and the ways that racial and cultural biases are perpetuated in the public education system. Argues that the schools can have a powerful, positive effect on racism in society and offers recommendations to educators and policymakers.

Ploumis-Devick, E.  

Provides definitions and descriptions, followed by research-based guidelines for and specific examples of classroom activities that can promote learning and social harmony in culturally diverse settings. Includes listings of resource materials and organizations.

Sapon-Shevin, M.  

Describes the purposes and activities of a two-week minicourse designed to raise the consciousness of seventh grade participants regarding people with disabilities. Activities provided information, engaged students in vicarious experiences regarding the situation of disabled people in society, and created opportunities for participants to engage in advocacy activities aimed at improving societal conditions for the disabled.

Sears, J. T.  

Discusses the need for anti-harassment guidelines in schools that can help protect gay and lesbian students from mistreatment by their peers. Describes current sex education programs as typically being ôemotionally dry, morally rigid, and intellectually sterile,ö and calls for new approaches which encourage student inquiry and address a broader range of topics of interest to them.

Seiter, D. M.  

Provides synopses of several resources that have been indexed and abstracted by Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) staff. While much of the information is directed at the classroom teacher, some resources point to the need for institutional changes to reduce/eradicate prejudice.

Sharan, Y., and Sharan, S.  

Offers an in-depth discussion of Group Investigation, a cooperative learning method which emphasizes active inquiry, student interaction, interpretive activities to give meaning to what is learned, and intrinsic motivation. Philosophical
foundation, components, examples, outcomes, and recommended teacher training are described.

Sonnenschein, F. M.

Discusses several criminal acts in contemporary news reports that were the result of racial, ethnic, religious, and other forms of prejudice. Identifies approaches educators can take to fostering positive intergroup relationships and highlights, in particular, the kinds of anti-prejudice activities that can be undertaken in elementary and secondary social studies classes.

Taylor, O. L.

Provides a rationale for improving educators' expertise in cross-cultural communication skills and offers an overview of concepts and practices related to effective cross-cultural communications. Includes information on reducing/eliminating cultural bias from tests and placement measures.

Teaching Tolerance
A semi-annual publication of the Southern Poverty Law Center, a nonprofit legal and education foundation based in Montgomery, Alabama. The journal is free to educators. Write to: Teaching Tolerance, 400 Washington Ave., Montgomery, Alabama 36104.

Offers research findings, program descriptions, classroom teaching ideas, reviews, statistical information, and so on, aimed at helping teachers to foster interracial, interethnic, and other kinds of intergroup harmony among their students.

Trachtenberg, S. J.

Identifies some of the barriers to the widespread implementation of multi-cultural education in the schools and advances reasons that adopting a truly multicultural perspective is beneficial to and urgently needed by our nation.

Walsh, D.

Discusses the nature of prejudice and describes the ways that the development of critical thinking skills can enable students to avoid prejudicial thinking. Describes the kinds of classroom environments and exercises that can help students to build skills in critical thinking.

Yao, E. L.
Presents survey results gathered from teachers in 63 Texas public schools to determine the kinds and extent of multi-cultural education activities taking place in their schools. In general, findings included that most schools gave relatively little attention to multicultural materials, programming, or staff development. The author offers several recommendations for expanding multicultural activities.

This publication is based on work sponsored wholly, or in part, by the Office of Educational Research and Improvement (OERI), U.S. Department of Education, under Contract Number RP91002001. The content of this publication does not necessarily reflect the views of OERI, the Department, or any other agency of the U.S. Government.

This publication is in the public domain and may be reproduced and disseminated without permission. Please acknowledge NWREL as the developer.

November 1993